

**Strategic consultation on the FE workforce and Initial
Teacher Education workforce
for the Education & Training Foundation**

July 2014

Jo Hutchinson
Siobhan Neary
John Marriott
Heather Jackson

Table of Contents

1	Introduction.....	1
1.1	The project brief	1
1.2	Data sources	2
2	The FE workforce: drivers and barriers to entry	3
2.1	Introduction	3
2.2	Characteristics of the FE workforce	3
2.3	Drivers and barriers to entry – what the literature says	10
2.4	Perspectives from stakeholders and providers	15
2.5	Future research questions	27
3	Initial Teacher Education	29
3.1	Introduction	29
3.2	ITE and professionalisation of the sector	29
3.3	ITE: what the literature says	30
3.4	Perspectives from stakeholders and providers	33
4	Summary	40
4.1	Introduction	40
4.2	Characterising the FE workforce.....	40
4.3	Characterising the ITE workforce.....	41
5	Annex 1: Methodology.....	42
5.1	Literature Review	42
5.2	Discussion themes	42
5.3	Case Study Interviews.....	43
	Annex 2: Research Participants.....	45
	Bibliography	46

1 Introduction

1.1 The project brief

The Education and Training Foundation was established on 1st August 2013 with an overarching remit to improve professionalism and standards in the education and training sector. One of the outcomes of the national consultation which preceded the development of the Foundation was that it should *'foster and promote professionalism to support the development of best practice through research, innovation and excellence in teaching, learning and assessment'*.

In December 2013 the Education and Training Foundation conducted a tendering exercise to investigate a series of issues simultaneously that would inform its strategic direction. iCeGS at the University of Derby were commissioned to explore the two questions outlined below.

Question 1: Identify and examine the barriers in attracting candidates with higher qualifications/skills into the FE sector

It is perceived that the majority of teaching staff within the FE sector arrive in teaching as a second or third career. Gleeson and Mardle (1980) suggest that only a few FE practitioners can trace their roots to a desire to teach in FE. Gleeson, Davies and Wheeler (2005) suggest that most arrive in FE due to an opportunity at a particular time. They argue that this is often related to other lifestyle changes including career breaks, redundancy, divorce and relocation. The terms 'sliding' and 'accidental transition' are used to describe how individuals find themselves in an FE role. Many arrive via a variety of part time and sessional contracts over a number of years and often for a number of institutions. Under such circumstances the experience of teacher training in FE will be different to that for secondary schools for example where the transition into teaching is distinct, of a clear duration and comprises a common set of learning actions. The phased entry to FE teaching has implications for the experience and quality of ITE.

Question 2: Explore whether ITE teaching predominantly attracts people from a humanities background and if so, assess the implications for a quality ITE experience.

Little is known of the makeup of the ITE workforce and the backgrounds of those who have responsibility for the development and delivery of ITE programmes for the FE and learning sector (Noel, 2006). There is a perception that many teacher educators, particularly those delivering programmes in Higher Education Institutions gravitate from humanities and liberal study backgrounds. Research conducted by Noel in 2006 identified the workforce as being predominantly female, white older and better qualified than the general FE teaching workforce. They come from backgrounds teaching in Business and Management, Social Sciences and Humanities. It will be important for ETF to understand the characteristics of provision of ITE, to assess the extent to which it is fit for purpose, and to assess the extent to which it provides a quality learning experience for FE educators.

This report presents the findings of a series of research activities which were undertaken to inform these questions between 23rd January and 14th March, 2014. Further details of these are provided in Annex 1.

1.2 Data sources

The consultation areas were explored using the following data sources:

- Summary of prior analyses of sector reviews that mapped both the FE workforce and that of the initial teacher education sector
- A rapid targeted literature review of issues and themes explored by previous research
- Case study interviews of FE teachers and educators
- Consultations with key stakeholders
- Consultations with those working in operational roles within the FE workforce.

	Q1	Q2
Secondary data source analysis	Review reports to summarise current profile of FE teaching workforce	Review reports to summarise current profile of those delivering ITE
Literature Review	To explore career trajectories into teaching in FE sector and barriers / enablers to entry	To explore career trajectories into ITE and characteristics of workforce.
Case studies	Career stories of people who work or have worked in both vocational and academic teaching – plus informal conversation about the project.	Career stories of people who work or have worked in ITE plus informal conversation about the project.
Stakeholder interviews	Interviews with people who have a strategic oversight of the needs of the FE workforce.	Interviews with people who have a strategic oversight of the needs of the FE workforce.
Operational interviews	Interviews with people who manage FE recruitment.	Interviews with people who manage ITE delivery. Interviews with people who manage ITE planning within FE.

The research team secured a total of 18 stakeholder and operational interviews and five case studies. Details of participants are provided in Annex 2.

Each interviewer was informed about the purpose of the research, who commissioned it, how the conversation was being recorded and how it would be used by the research team. They were asked to affirm that they understood this process either verbally (which was digitally recorded) or by signing an informed consent form. Those people who participated as case studies were assured that their names or employer organisations would not be named in the report or shared any further than the research team at the University of Derby.

2 The FE workforce: drivers and barriers to entry

2.1 Introduction

The FE sector is very diverse and its workforce equally so. In this section we present an overview of the workforce derived from work undertaken by ETF's predecessors in order to provide contextual background and to outline some of the challenges which exist that relate to quantifying the nature and characteristics of the workforce within the 'ETF footprint'. We then summarise some of the themes which are presented in previous research about both the drivers that encourage people into the sector, and conversely the barriers to entry. It is important to explore both the 'push' and the 'pull' factors as they may work differently for different groups of people. This section then presents an analysis of the feedback from people we have spoken to about some of these themes. This section concludes by outlining future research questions which ETF may wish to consider.

2.2 Characteristics of the FE workforce

2.2.1 Key reports

There is a limited evidence base that describes who works in the education and skills sector and the qualifications they hold. This is partly attributable to the fact that the sector is both broad and diverse and common definitions of the roles of those who work within it are not captured by national data sources. As a consequence, the organisations that have had oversight of the sector have all had to commission or undertake their own reviews of their workforce.

This review is based on the following key resources which use a variety of data sources to generate overviews of the characteristics of the workforce.

- DBIS (2012). *Evaluation of FE Teachers' Qualifications (England) Regulations 2007*. London: Department for Business Innovation and Skills (DBIS).
- LSIS and HOLEX (2013). *Adult and Community Learning Workforce Survey 2011/12*. London: LSIS.
- LSIS (2013). *An Analysis of the Staff Individualised Record Data 2011-2012*. London: LSIS.
- LSIS and Association of Employment Advisers (2013). *Work Based Learning Workforce Survey 2011/12*. London: LSIS.

2.2.2 Demographic characteristics of the workforce

In 2013 Learning and Skills Improvement Service (LSIS) evaluated the 2011-12 Staff Individualised Record (SIR) data to understand the profile of the further education sector. Their results were based on responses received from 266 further education colleges. They

estimated that there was a total of 168,333 staff working in the sector in England, of whom 82,593 were teaching staff (lecturers, tutors or trainers)¹, and 1,988 were trainers.

- The report also found that 47.9% of full-time teaching staff were female, although this rises to 66.2% of part time teaching staff. For trainers within the sector 60% were male compared 40% female. These proportions remained largely static over the previous five years.
- The average age of teaching staff was 46 years, with 31.7% of teaching staff being aged between 45 and 54 years and 9% of teachers being under 30 years. The survey also revealed that the age profile of the sector had not changed significantly over the previous five years.
- In terms of ethnicity, 79.9 % of 'teaching staff' were white British, 4.5% white other, 3.5% Asian, 2.6% Black / African / Caribbean / Black British and 1.1% were Chinese.
- The report also revealed that 3.5% of teaching staff said that they were disabled.

The average salary for teaching in 2011-12 was £29,696 for teaching staff. Interestingly, over the previous five years, average salaries for female teachers had increased marginally more than their male counterparts (8.1% female, 6.8% male) but male salaries were still marginally higher than those of their female counterparts.

LSIS and Association of Employment Advisers (AELP) (2013) explored the demographic and employment profile of the work based learning (WBL) sector. This was based on a survey which drew a 22% response rate from the 496 AELP provider members and was extrapolated using data drawn from the Labour Force Survey (LFS) 2011. This work suggested that:

- the workforce for the sector was roughly 38,000 people
- 86% were employed full time (more than in FE colleges)
- 48% of the workforces were professionals (i.e. assessors, trainers and tutors).
- 62% of work based learning staff were female
- 37% of the sector was 34 years or younger (a more youthful profile than the college or ACL sectors)
- 74.6% identified themselves as white, 3.4% Asian / Asian British, 2.6% Black / African / Caribbean / Black British, and 1.3% mixed ethnicity.
- 83% of teachers either held or were working towards a relevant teaching qualification.
- 7% held qualifications at level 7, 19% level 6, 18% level 5, 24% level 4, 24% at level 3 and 7% below level 3.

For the Adult community sector, LSIS and HOLEX (2013) mapped the sector in 2011-12, using a survey based on a sampling frame of the three different types of provider (Local authority, sub-contracted and independent provider) and achieved a responses rate of 38% of the sector. From this they estimated that

¹ Although the report did not define these terms, "teachers and trainers" or "teachers" to cover all those who directly support learning in education and skills, including lecturers, teachers, trainers, tutors, assessors, instructors and trainee teachers.

- The sector employs between 27,000 and 31,000 staff
- The age profile for the sector was generally older with 11% being 34 years or younger and 30% being 55 years or older.
- Most staff work part time (92%)
- 84% of teachers held, or were working towards, a teaching qualification.
- 0.8% held a qualification at level 8, 23.3% level 7, 31.4% at level 6, 9.3% at level 5, 18.5% at level 4, 11.4% at level 3 and 5.4% below level 3.

The Table one below presents a summary of the teaching workforce for the education and skills three main sectors for 2011-2012.

Table One: Summary of the teaching workforce for the education and skills three main sectors for 2011 - 2012.

Demographic profile of staff	Further education Colleges	Work based learning (WBL)	Adult community sector
Number of staff and Teachers Lecturers, tutors and, trainers	168,333 (82,593 teachers)	38,000 (18,00 teachers)	27,000-31,000 staff
Ethnicity sector as a whole			
White British	79.9%	74.6%	83%
Asian or Asian British	3.5%	3.4%	7%
Black / African / Caribbean / Black British	n/a	2.6%	4%
Mixed ethnicity	n/a	1.3%	3%
Chinese	1.1%	n/a	n/a
White other	4.5%	n/a	n/a
Gender female	59% female	62% female	79% female
Teachers part-time/full time (based on surveys)	n/a	86% part-time	92% part-time

Sources: LSIS (2013). *An Analysis of the Staff Individualised Record Data 2011-2012*. London: LSIS.
 LSIS and Association of Employment Advisers (2013). *Work Based Learning Workforce Survey 2011/12*. London: LSIS.
 LSIS and HOLEX (2013). *Adult and Community Learning Workforce Survey 2011/12*. London: LSIS.

Qualifications level held by teaching staff

Table Two: Highest qualification held by teaching and training staff.

Level of Teaching Qualification	Colleges	Work based learning	Adult Community Learning
Level 8	n/a	0%	0.8%
Level 7	24.2%	7%	23.3%
Level 6	7.4%	19%	31.4%
Level 5	26.7%	18%	9.3%
Level 4	8.3%	24%	18.5%
Level 3	7.3%	24%	11.4%
Level 2 or below	n/a	8%	5%
Other or not known	26.3%	0%	0.4%
Teachers held or were working toward a teaching qualifications	80%*	83%	84%

Sources: * DBIS (2012). *Evaluation of FE Teachers' Qualifications (England) Regulations 2007*. London: Department for Business, Innovation and Skills (DBIS).

LSIS (2012). *Further Education College Workforce Data for England An analysis of the Staff Individualised Record (SIR) 2010-11*. London: LSIS.

LSIS and Association of Employment Advisers (2013). *Work Based Learning Workforce Survey 2011/12*. London: LSIS.

LSIS and HOLEX (2013). *Adult and Community Learning Workforce Survey 2011/12*. London: LSIS

In 2010, Lifelong Learning UK (LLUK) with the UK Commission for Employment and Skills (UKCES, 2010) mapped the sector using information based on LSC Staff Individualised Record (SIR) from the year 2004/05. They found that:

- 47% of all FE staff held a qualification at NVQ level 4 or above, 12% at Level 3, 10% at Level 2, and 5% held no formal qualifications. Specifically for FE teachers, 80% of full-time FE teaching staff held recognised teaching qualifications.
- For the work based learning (WBL) sector the same report found that 41% of the 976 WBL trainers who responded to the survey held professional qualifications, 15% held their highest qualification at NVQ level 2, and 14%, held a qualification at the highest level of NVQ level 5.

- Within the Community Learning and Development (CLD) sector they found that of the 1,577 CLD respondents, 91% were teachers or tutors and more than a quarter of these (27%) held a qualification at NVQ level 5 equivalent.

Qualifications held by teachers was also investigated in 2010-11 by LSIS (2012). This found that over the previous five years there had been a small general increase in the level of qualifications held by teaching staff in the sector.

Table two gives the highest qualification held by teaching and training staff based on the most recent data reports available.

Teaching qualifications

LLUK (2011) found that 45,590 (18.4%) of the workforce were enrolled on a teaching qualification in 2010 and that this figure had been similar for the preceding three years.

In 2012 DBIS evaluated the impact of regulations introduced in 2007 that required teaching staff in the sector to hold or be working towards a teaching qualification. They found that since 2003-04 there had been a year-on-year increase in teaching qualifications at Level 5 or above and an overall increase in the numbers of teachers holding a recognised teaching qualification across the sector. However ACL and WBL qualification rates were found to be lower than colleges. In addition they estimated that 62.4% of the FE college teaching workforce is qualified at or working towards a teaching qualification at Level 5 or above.

They concluded that the regulations to require a teaching qualification had generally had a positive impact and were welcomed by teachers across the sector. However, there was no evidence that it had improved retention or career progression. In fact, some providers highlighted that the short-term impact of the regulations had created a barrier to recruiting those with significant industry experience, particularly in vocational subjects where shortages already existed such as construction, motor vehicle engineering and catering.

The most up to date figures on enrolment on teaching qualification courses within the sector are available from LLUK for 2009-10. This data relates to teachers in the further education sector and are presented in Table four below. This shows that 55% of those working in the FE sector had qualified through a university programme. In 2009-10 45,590 (18.4%) were known to be enrolled on a teaching qualification. University provision has been an important component of provision with Crawley (2012) suggesting that for each of the three years from 2007/8 to 2009/10, more than 20,000 trainee teachers were registered on longer university teacher education programmes - i.e. Cert Ed / PGCE.

Table Three: Percentage of College teaching staff holding teaching qualifications, 2010-2011.

Teaching Qualification	Number of teachers	Percentage holding a qualification
Level 6/7 Postgraduate Certificate in Education (PGCE)	25,653	24.2%
Level 6 Bed/BA BSC with concurrent teacher qualification status level	7,861	7.4%
Level 5 Diploma in Teaching in the Lifelong Learning Sector (DTLLS)	2,922	2.8%
Level 5 Certificate of Education	25,307	23.9%
Level 4 Certificate in Teaching in the Lifelong Learning Sector (CTLLS)	993	0.9%
Level 4 FE Teaching Qualification – Stage 3	1,392	1.3%
Level 4 FE Teaching Qualification – Stage 2	1,657	1.6%
Level 4 FE Teaching Qualification – Stage 1	1,603	1.5%
Level 3 or 4 Preparing to Teach in the Lifelong Learning Sector (PTLLS)	3,234	3%
Level 3 Teaching Qualification (e.g. CG 7303)	5,368	5.1%
Level 3 Learning and Development Awards	2,230	2.1%
Other teaching qualification not listed	3,945	3.7%
None of the above	5,059	4.8%
Not known/not provided	18,829	17.8%
Total	106,053	100%

Source: Lifelong Learning UK(LLUK). (2011). *Further Education Workforce Data for England. An Analysis of the Staff Individualised Record Data 2009–10*. Coventry: LLUK.

Table Four: Enrolment on teaching qualifications, 2009-2010.

Teaching Qualification	Number	Percentage
Preparing to Teach in the Lifelong Learning Sector (PTLLS)	2,968	6.5%
Certificate to Teach in the Lifelong Learning Sector (CTLLS)	879	1.9%
Diploma to Teach in the Lifelong Learning Sector (DTLLS)	2,807	6.2%
Certificate of Education	10,883	23.9%
Postgraduate Certificate in Education (PGCE)	10,114	22.2%
BEd/BA/BSc with concurrent qualified teacher status	2,786	6.1%
Level 4 FE Teaching Qualification - Stage 3	1,002	2.2%
Level 4 FE Teaching Qualification - Stage 2	1,161	2.5%
Level 4 FE Teaching Qualification - Stage 1	1,229	2.7%
Level 3 Teaching Qualification (e.g. CG 7303)	2,546	5.6%
Learning and Development Awards	3,848	8.4%
Other teaching qualification not listed	5,367	11.8%
Total	45,590	100%

Source: LLUK (2011). *Further Education Workforce Data for England. An Analysis of the Staff Individualised Record Data 2009–10*. Coventry: LLUK

2.2.3 Data issues

The above analysis reveals issues about the quality of data. No organisation has been able to provide definitive information on even basic characteristics such as the size of the sector. The best source of data is Staff Individualised Records, however this dataset has missing returns as not all providers complete the survey. In addition SIR data has suffered by not keeping accurate or consistent data on the qualifications held by staff and it makes no distinction between teaching staff and those who are working as teacher educators. In addition SIR data relies on staff contracts; as 10 to 15 per cent of staff have multiple contracts this has implications for the accuracy of data.

Furthermore, use of the Labour Force Survey is difficult. Firstly this is collected using Standard Occupational Codes which is categorised differently into broader subject categories than those collected by SIR data which makes comparisons difficult. Standard Industrial Classification codes and SOC codes do not distinguish between work based learning, adult community learning and individuals working in colleges. Further, SIR data

relies on employers to provide the information, whereas as Labour Force Survey relies on individuals, which also makes comparing them difficult.

Data is a key issue and the Education and Training Foundation delivery plan (2012) makes a commitment to improve data collection in this area by:

- Continue Staff Individualised Record (SIR) Data collection 2013-14 and independent and community learning provider surveys;
- Review current arrangements with partners to develop refreshed approach;
- Review mechanisms for the collection of qualification data across the workforce and;
- Review mechanisms for the collection of data relating to numbers.

2.3 Drivers and barriers to entry – what the literature says

There is a rich evidence base on the barriers and enablers which encourage or persuade people to train and work in the education sector, particularly in schools. There is less research looking specifically at the education and skills sector. In addition there is very limited research that explores what motivates candidates with higher qualification into the sector.

The largest study looking at the barriers to working in the sector was completed by Wilson *et al* (2005). They based their research on 5,492 interviews which were conducted across 914 organisations. Although teachers/trainers views were not separated out from the findings they made up a total of 52% of the responses and were therefore a clear focus. The researchers found that the majority of the respondents had joined the sector aged 18 to 34 (68%) with a further 28% of respondents starting between the ages of 35 and 44. The vast majority of staff (78%) had previous experience in the sector, 9% were school teachers with 12% having no previous experience.

Respondents reported a high level of satisfaction, indicated through both quantitative and qualitative research. Staff motivation for joining the sector was largely based around a sense of it being a vocation and wanting to give something back to society or to fulfil a desire for a career change. A small minority of staff (9%) saw teaching in the sector as a springboard to an academic career.

The main barriers they identified were; the lack of awareness of the routes into the sector, limited career progression opportunities within it, the time to be recruited, and the time and cost to qualify, low pay and status of the sector, and recruitment and selection issues. Similarly UKCES identified better remuneration, career development and progression, together with support for existing employees to further develop their skills as being the main barriers to recruitment within education. The following section explores the themes in the literature.

2.3.1 Awareness of routes into the sector and career progression opportunities

Wilson *et al* (2005) found flexible working to be a key issue. Some argued there were not enough flexible part-time opportunities whilst others argued the opposite, that they could not find suitable full-time opportunities. In addition 31% of staff believed that there not enough entry routes into the education and skills profession.

There is a limited but growing evidence base on the progression routes into and through the sector but as Jephcote and Salisbury (2009) highlighted knowledge about teachers career and progression in the sector are perhaps only marginally beyond the 'shadowy figures'

stage. They indicate there is a small body of work looking at the biographies of teachers in the sector. Jephcote and Salisbury concluded that teachers come to the sector from a variety of ways although the majority having had prior experience in the labour market in the occupational area in which they teach. Based on their interviews with 28 teachers from the sector in Wales they found that the majority of the vocational entrants were late entrants to the teaching profession having had careers within industry. However, a minority of the interviewees had followed a less complex path coming from University and then into teacher training.

LSIS (2013) highlighted the importance of support and information about the best progression routes for trainee teachers who are new to the sector. LSIS also suggested a need for simplified qualifications and progression routes and a generic qualification that could be used in other areas of education to ease progression. To aid this the Education and Training Foundation have a FE advice website which covers, support available, routes into training, where to train and funding information.

2.3.2 Recruitment processes

Gleeson, Davies and Wheeler (2005) suggest that most teachers arrive in FE due to an opportunity at a particular time. They argue that this is often related to lifestyle changes including career breaks, redundancy, divorce and relocation. The terms 'sliding' and 'accidental transition' are used to describe how individuals find themselves in an FE role. Many arrive via part time and sessional contracts often juggling a variety of contracts over a number of years for a number of institutions.

Wilson *et al.* (2005) found a barrier in the time it took for students to be recruited due to lengthy recruitment procedures relating to strict local authority guidelines, which they believed could discourage some of the most able candidates.

The OECD reviews (2009, 2011) of vocational education highlighted the need for more flexible diversified routes to attract candidates with industrial experience, they identified three approaches to achieving this; allowing and encouraging staff to work part-time as trainers and part-time in industry citing the examples of Mexico and the Netherlands of countries that do this. The second approach was using alternative certification systems, such as distance learning, or recognition of prior learning to attract highly qualified candidates to the profession. Thirdly, flexible training and recruitment to encourage people equipped with practical workplace skills to become trainers in VET institutions, such as in Korea.

The Skills Commission (2010) recommended that in order to improve recruitment into the sector, there was a need to recognise Accreditation of Prior Experiential Learning (APEL) when developing any career change schemes to attract new people to the sector. They advocated developing a Teach Next and Teach First for Further Education based on the successful systems already developed in schools. The Skills Commission also advocated a 'Teach Too' model based on encouraging talented and experienced people into the sector who would be attracted to part-time work.

2.3.3 Securing teaching qualifications

The requirement for a teaching qualification was reported by Wilson *et al* (2005) to be a barrier to entry. This was said to be a particular barrier to applicants who had vocational

experience but who were concerned about the time required to become fully qualified. At that time 78% of teachers had experience from other industries so this is a major barrier to new recruits.

Research by IfL suggested that the average starting age of new recruits to the sector is 37 years old (Skills Commission, 2010) which is nine years older than the school sector. The higher age and more complex needs of these groups make it important that new teachers can move quickly into a full teaching role. As Orr (2009) highlighted, 90% of teachers in the sector complete their training through teacher training or a part-time in-service basis. Orr and Simmons also identified that initial teachers from a vocational background tend to value their previous identity over their new teaching role, and argued that this 'dual professionalism' can hinder development. In March 2013, the Commission on Adult Vocational Teaching and Learning which was created under the DBIS reform plan for the sector, 'New Challenges, New Chances'. They argued that the best vocational teachers have dual identities, as both occupational specialists and as pedagogical experts, however the defining characteristic is their occupational specialism. They recommended for ITE that there was a need to revise and strengthen the education and training arrangements for VET teachers through emphasis on professional development and continuing professional development plans, to further develop dual professionalism. They also recognised the need for vocational specialist to spend time in the relevant workplace to update their knowledge on new technology and developments.

2.3.4 Terms and conditions

Wilson *et al* (2005) highlighted the low pay and status of the sector as a barrier to entry. This was raised as a concern by managers who believed that better rates of pay were offered by industry and the schools sector. At the time of the research, the hardest to fill vacancies were in health/social care and public services, engineering, construction and business administration.

2.3.5 Lack of professional esteem

Wilson *et al* (2005) reported that 40% of staff were aware of recruitment difficulties within their workplace. In terms of what causes difficulties in filling job vacancies, the main factor identified by HR respondents were related to the status of the sector causing difficulty attracting younger staff into teaching and a lack of suitably qualified applicants. These issues were also explored in relation to staff working in the sector, the majority of whom were happy to be working in the sector, but did raise concerns relating to morale which could impact on recruiting new people to the sector. The issues they identified included lack of funding from the college to support their development, low pay and insecure terms and conditions, limited career pathways, excessive bureaucracy, lack of administrative support, emphasis on targets, and management being too removed from teaching.

Lucas and Nasta (2010) characterise this as a 'fragmented and impoverished professional culture' which makes attracting the best applicants difficult. They warn that this weak professional culture often leads to weak support for new trainees and lack of professional development for teachers. Lawry and Tedder (2011) highlighted the high turnover of staff compared to the school sector, 'and the sector's lack of involvement in the formation and evaluation of changes within the sector as damaging to professional identity and making the profession less attractive'.

Research by Further Education Reputation Strategy Group (2012) highlighted the important role that reputation of an organisation has in attracting the best staff. The research also found that although staff in the sector were strong advocates for the education and training delivered, they are less positive as advocates for working in the sector. The report recommended that the sector needs to apply communication, branding and reputation management strategies to the internal market as much as the external market to improve the overall reputation of the sector.

2.3.6 Recruitment and selection

Research on hard to fill vacancies within the sector by DBIS (2012) highlighted construction, motor vehicle engineering and catering as areas with the hardest to fill vacancies. They suggested that the requirement to have a teaching qualification was believed to have a negative impact on recruitment of industry experts into the sector and was forcing people to leave the sector. However, the Lingfield review (2012a) supported this argument and recommended that giving employers and teachers more autonomy to set levels of requirements for qualifications would make them more professional and therefore able to attract the best candidates based on their own needs.

More recently the Association of Colleges (AoC, 2013) annual recruitment survey reported that 86.3% of colleges had teaching vacancies in 2013 which was an increase from 77.1% in 2012. The areas with the highest vacancies were in Basic Skills (ESOL literacy and Numeracy teachers) (13.9%), other visual arts, (10.2%), construction (9.5%), Health and Social Care (7.9%), Engineering (7.6%), Hospitality, Sport, Leisure and Travel (7.6%), Business (7.4%) and Maths (5.3%). The hardest to fill vacancies reported by colleges relating to teaching, were Engineering (41%), Construction (24%), Maths (19%) and Science (15%). The AoC (2013) identified a number of barriers to recruiting staff into the sector from the colleges perspective, the four main barriers for teaching staff were lack of necessary specialist skills, insufficient experience and applicants looking for more pay than was being offered and insufficient relevant qualifications. Similarly, research by LLUK (2010) indicates that the sector generally struggles to recruit staff from industry with vocational qualifications, however, the persistent skills shortages in the sector relate to: maths; Skills for Life; engineering; information and communication technology (ICT); science; business administration; management; health and social care; and management and leadership within the sector.

The AoC also found the most popular methods used to recruit teaching staff were colleges' own websites, sector-specialist recruitment websites and generic websites and as can be seen from the table below colleges use a variety of methods to attract teaching staff.

In addition, the AAoC found that colleges had been seen to be responding positively to Government policy and incentives by recruiting more English and Maths teachers to cover for the requirement for all young people not achieving a grade C or above in Maths and English having to continue to study these subjects from 2013. In addition colleges had been responding to Government initiatives in this area by creating a scheme to attract English and Maths graduates, providing extra hours for part-time staff and up skilling existing staff.

Table Five: Proportion of colleges using different methods to attract teaching candidates.

Methods to attract candidates	Proportion of Colleges
College website	97.5%
Sector specific websites	72.1%
Recruitment Agencies	54.9%
Local newspaper	49.2%
National Newspaper	46.7%
Trade press/specialist journal	46.7%
Job Centre	34.4%
Social media	19.7%
Encouraging speculative applications	18.9%
Recruitment fairs	9.8%
Other	4.1%
Radio or TV advert	3.3%
Posters/billboards	2.5%
Employee referral scheme	1.8%

Source: AoC (2013). *Survey of Recruitment and Retention in Further Education Colleges 2013*. Association of Colleges (AoC).

Strebler *et al.* (2005) looked at the recruitment and retention of teachers with industrial or professional experience, who are considered a problematic group to recruit due to their lack of knowledge and awareness about the sector. They argued that the key to recruiting this group was a more proactive recruitment approach based around using multiple channels to promote opportunities. They also identified a number of approaches that had been developed by employers in the sector that included:

- converting part-time posts into fractional posts;
- recruiting existing part-time staff onto full time posts - 'growing their own';
- spotting potential recruits from their teacher training courses;
- running open days, e-mailing past students;
- using links with external examiners to provide contacts with eligible candidates;

- advertising vacancies in the national press;
- contacting relevant networks; and
- using word of mouth recommendations.

The research also highlighted the importance of extra support for trainees from vocational backgrounds to gain a teaching qualification, particularly around mentoring and funding support.

2.4 Perspectives from stakeholders and providers

This section now presents the perspectives of the stakeholders, operational managers and case studies on the issues explored in the literature and policy review.

2.4.1 Characterising the FE workforce – current composition and future needs

Almost every response to queries about how to characterise the workforce started with the qualification that the sector is very broad and diverse. One respondent was particularly concerned that policy makers were unable to understand the sector's richness and complexity:

'Ministers generally do not understand FE – it is a complicated, diverse sector offering a whole range of different programmes and opportunities, e.g. access courses, second chance learning, vocational skills, apprenticeship training, teacher training etc.'

Consequently the FE workforce is also very diverse, multi and variably skilled with a broad range of teaching levels and qualifications. While this creates some difficulties it also has distinct advantages in that it brings vibrancy to the sector.

'The remit in the FE and skills sector is so much broader it is not just going into a classroom to teach. People can be teaching very challenging groups, adults, adult community ed, working with employers. My College as an example delivers A levels, FE as engineering, hairdressing, life skills and employability programmes for students with additional support needs, HE courses and adult community ed.'

Motivations for wanting to work in the education and skills sector vary. Respondents generated a list of potential motivators:

- want to teach (learning and skills is one possibility);
- have actually gone through a learning and skills background themselves;
- may have been non-traditional learners (these people often actively seek teaching roles in FE – they want to contribute to the sector);
- were really considering secondary and may not have strong idea of FE sector until it is pointed out to them;
- like the idea of teaching young adults, in the case of Bath College, mostly full-time 16-18 year olds;
- like teaching people who have made a choice;

- like the terms and conditions and the pension;
- attracted by shorter academic year (36 weeks);
- drawn by the vocational element;
- like ideology of FE – dealing with second chance – is a draw, particularly in the craft areas;
- rewards seen as bigger – the ability to turn somebody around; and
- ‘there’s something about the FE sector – when you see how it transforms people’s lives’.

Newcastle College Group

As illustration of the diversity of the sector, the organisations listed below form the Newcastle College Group (NCG) – a collaborative FE and skills sector partnership:

- Newcastle College (large HE led college)
- West Lancashire College (smaller regional college)
- Rathbone (working with NEETS, street engagement etc.)
- In Training (training provider running government programmes)
- Newcastle 6th form College

While the NCG is a specific partnership arrangement and not necessarily typical of what happens in other parts of the sector, it does illustrate and reflect the diversity of the learning and skills sector covering as it does a broad range of range of settings with different providers addressing very different needs.

The NCG School of Education used to be a faculty in Newcastle College but now provides a service for the whole of the NCG. Their trainee teacher programmes are offered across the group (as well as to external providers) and they work with the employers to ensure that the teacher education provided prepares trainee teachers for their setting – whether this is training provider, Adult and Community Learning, FE colleges, HE in FE settings, secondary schools or academies.

In addition to these personal motivators there are a number of structural factors that influence the nature and make-up of the workforce. In particular the economic geography of the environment, its location and the focus of a college has a strong influence on the nature of the workforce.

Gillian Case study

Gillian has been working at the University for five years. She was initially employed as the programme leader for the part-time DTTLs course, which had also been her role at the college where she previously worked. She is now the programme leader for the full-time Professional Graduate Certificate in Education.

Gillian has a degree in International Business Studies and worked for eight years in HR. She decided she wanted a career change and applied to do a PGCE (Secondary). She didn't have a particular preference to teach young people but thought she might teach in colleges. She was not aware that separate teaching qualifications were available for FE. She did teacher training in Wales after which she worked at two colleges on a sessional contract working 15 hours for each. She taught on the CIPD professional programme, General Studies and BTEC and GNVQ Business Studies.

She wanted to move and applied for a teacher training post at a college, although she had no background in teacher training she thought she would have ago. She was really surprised to be offered the job and felt that she got it because of her CIPD background. There were no particular requirements to work in ITE. The person who managed the ITE programme also managed the CIPD programme and thought she could teach on both. She taught on City & Guilds 7302, CTTLS and CPD programmes. The college started to work with a new local university and Gillian applied for a job with them and got it. She wasn't particularly looking to leave FE but just saw the opportunity.

She is not sure about future plans; she has had an acting-up role as an Assistant Subject Head but is not sure this is her next step. She is interested in policy and would possibly like to work for a national organisation. At the moment she is enjoying her job and is happy to stick with what she is doing.

In the past, colleges that were mainly vocational have tended to have an older experienced workforce that had 'come from the tools' and had completed ITE in service. They were unlikely to be graduates. However, the consultees suggested that now teachers coming from the trades were younger and may only have had four to five years' experience on the tools.

"We are increasingly getting younger people who have made a career decision they want to teach in FE, have noticed this over the last 10 years. On average they are aged from mid 20s to early 30s. Most will come with a DTTLs qualification. The younger applicants are more ambitious and competent they are looking for career progression".

“The workforce coming through now are inexperienced graduates who want to work in FE. Or they come from vocational areas with 3-4 years’ experience in their late 20s”.

This anecdotal evidence suggested that not only are they younger, but they are better qualified. A lot of experienced, established teachers are leaving as it is an ageing work force and being replaced by younger, better qualified but more inexperienced, teachers. Others conjectured that some new roles were being opened up as older teachers who struggled to meet the needs of the new quality and inspection regimes were leaving.

“We have had a lot of, particularly older people, leave as they struggle to meet the requirements of the Common Inspection Framework (CIF), particularly meeting the innovative strategy requirements”.

The FE sector continues to be attractive for career changers who may have a lot of experience in a particular sector and are looking for a way to utilise it. Often it may be that they have had a physical job which places increasing demands on their health and physical wellbeing as they get older.

“Tend to get people who are getting older, often struggling with doing a physical job. This is a factor, they think it will be easier and then find the work in FE is exhausting. Often people may have been doing the job for 20 years and have a lot of experience and want to give something back. Some others may have done a lot of training, had apprentices and lots of experience and get interested”.

For others, who have worked in lower paid occupations such as hairdressing or travel and tourism, who don’t want to go into management or run their own businesses, it can provide an attractive opportunity.

HR managers’ report that increasingly those joining the workforce generally have a teaching qualification and many have the level 5 Diploma. This is thought to be for a number of reasons:

- People are investing in the qualification prior to applying for jobs in the sector
- There is movement between colleges, if a course is closing at one college it may open somewhere else and qualified staff move to fill the vacancies.

There were a broad range of suggestions offered as to why FE was thought to be an attractive career choice.

Claire Case study

Claire is currently Curriculum Manager with responsibility for Initial Teacher Education and the Professional Studies programmes. Within these she leads the Cert Ed/PGCE and qualifications such as CIPS, CIM, ILM and AAT. She has only recently moved to the college after working in a neighbouring college for 14 years.

Claire left school with A'levels and worked initially as a shop assistant for a photo processing company, she progressed rapidly through the company becoming store manager and area manager at age 18 providing training and development for the company. After being made redundant she applied to the civil service as an A'level entrant. She took part in the Springboard programme which was a management development programme for women and worked across all departments within a national Government Agency. She successfully rose through the Agency becoming a Senior Executive Officer with responsibility for over 270 staff.

Claire decided that life was about more than money and decided she wanted to train to become a teacher. She left her job and started an Access course at her local college, she studied full time while working part time in a local bank. She was also recruited to teach on the City and Guilds 7407 after she was 'spotted' by one of her tutors and offered some part time teaching. She completed a degree in English and Education and then did a PGCE. Although she wanted to be a primary school teacher, after doing a taster placement she decided it was not for her and pursued a career in secondary education. However, she fell into FE as a career; she hadn't really considered this as a career option. Within FE she was the manager for early year's education and taught in health and social care. She then moved into ITE running a full time pre-service course.

She would like to move into a management role and perhaps be a head of school or a Vice Principal but really likes being a teacher and working with widening participation learners.

A genuine desire to teach was a common response. This may be for a number of reasons for example people felt they had a lot of knowledge that they wanted to share, they had got involved in teaching or mentoring as part of their role and want to develop this further. There was sense that people are passionate about their subject whether it is an academic subject or a vocational subject. They see themselves as a subject specialist and want a career which will allow them to work with their subject and to share their interest with others. This was specifically identified for trainees who had chosen to take the full time teacher training route.

'Most have a genuine desire to teach... they want to work with adults as they think they will be easier because they want to be there. Sometimes it is they can't get a job in their subject and it's a case of 'what else can I do... I might as well train to be a teacher'.

There was perception from ITE tutors that students choosing to do the full-time teacher training route often selected it because they couldn't get a 'job' in their subject and decided to teach as an alternative.

There was also an altruistic perspective which suggested that people wanted to give something back and that they wanted a job with a real sense of achievement.

'What is attractive is a real sense of achievement. Turning 'non-academic' young people into achieving qualifications. Changing behaviour, having an impact, making a difference. They can see that they can go to university, they can have a career. It is making a difference'.

There was a perception that people often have unrealistic expectations as to what a job in FE will be like. Often there is a belief that students in FE are older, motivated and proactively engaging in learning.

'People find it harder than they expected and are tired. If you are new to it is hard'.

There was also felt to be a lack of understanding as to what teaching is and what it is about. New entrants' frame of reference may be based on their own experience of learning which may be quite dated. There is also inconsistency in mentoring and support provided to new entrants into the profession. This inconsistency can even apply across colleges where a new entrants' experience will depend on the faculty they are in.

'It depends on which faculty you are in some are more supportive than others'.

Stability was suggested as another reason why FE was attractive. For some occupational areas the rates of pay are not bad and the pension is also attractive. Although there may be some staff turnover, it generally stays quite low in the colleges who participated in the study.

2.4.2 Skills shortages and skills gaps

Respondents recognised that there were specific vocational and subject areas that experience recruitment difficulties. While this is not an exhaustive list, and the position will vary from college to college, the following are those that were mentioned during interviews:

- Degree level Maths, English (there are bursaries - which are pre-service and for which candidates have to meet specific criteria - plus golden handshakes to encourage graduates in these areas to enter the sector);
- GCSE Maths and English (student programmes now contain an expectation of Maths and English);
- Academic subject specialists such as Physics, Sciences, Psychology; and
- Applied subjects including Engineering, Accountancy, Building Services, Uniformed services, Electrics, High level construction, and Civil engineering.

The reasons for these are varied, but most often it is linked to salaries, particularly for the professions, where candidates can get better paid elsewhere for work which is perceived to be less demanding or challenging.

'We struggle to recruit to basically anything that is a profession or is well paid. Also things like animal care or equine, they are not keen on the teaching'.

Recruitment to Bath College

In some cases Bath College say they have had to pay a 'market allowance' (payable at the end of a successful probationary period) to attract people. They suffer specifically from being in a relatively expensive area for property etc.

There is competition with schools for some subjects. There is also an aging profile in some subject areas in FE although Bath College noted that they have had more young people joining recently – particularly in areas like sport and foundation learning. In some cases people have done a PGCE placement at the College and then joined the staff.

Skills gaps identified were IT/ILT in classroom context (anyone over 40 has grown up with a different experience in this respect) and Maths and English for teachers in some vocational areas. For example, beauty and hairdressing has traditionally recruited from the sector people who are qualified, experienced hairdressers but who may not have the requisite qualifications in Maths and English. Bath College now have an intensive programme of staff development around Maths and English, and have a Maths and English group for staff.

2.4.3 Factors which detract people from considering FE

Respondents presented a range of views concerning the barriers to working in FE. These ranged from no particular barriers being identified to multiple barriers which included;

- Lack of prestige;
- Lack of promotion of the FE sector;
- Lack of awareness of the training and job opportunities within the FE sector;
- Terms and conditions; and
- Career development opportunities for those working in the sector.

The lack of parity with the statutory teaching sector was seen as a barrier by some. This was often allied with a lack of awareness of the FE sector as an option for someone interested in pursuing a teaching career. This is considered in more detail in the next section.

For many of those who are currently working in FE, few made a conscious decision to work in the sector. However once in the sector they recognised the attractiveness for those who are looking for a more flexible work life.

Cath Case study

Cath is a team manager in a 6th form college which is part of a wider college franchise. Her role is 0.5 FTE teaching and 0.5FTE management. She manages maths, sciences and business studies which represents a team of 13. It is deliberate policy at the college to ensure that managers at her level keep some teaching as it helps with professional practice (you have to keep up to date with teaching to be a credible manager) and helps to retain good staff who like to teach but who see management responsibilities as part of career progression. There are 4 staff at her level at the college.

She has been a qualified teacher since 1989 and has always worked in secondary schools. In 2002 she took a career break for family reasons but kept up to date professionally by doing some A level examining and occasional other work. When she started looking for work she wanted part time work and the only part time work available was at colleges. In Jan 2010 she started teaching Business Studies part time. In September 2013 she took the management role which had to be a full time post. She saw this as a last hurrah – to move her career on or to stay continually at the same level doing the same thing.

Comparison between working in schools and in colleges is very different. The college was rated 3 by Ofsted last time and this rating, plus some cultural factors drive everything.

1. Everything they do is overseen by policy – there's policy and systems for everything and its assumed that these are developed with vocational courses and learners in mind and not necessarily academic courses
2. The distance between the teachers and the managers is much closer at a school than it is at the college both physically and metaphorically
3. Colleges should have taller structures – there are no development opportunities so to progress your career you have to leave
4. Obsession about the 800 hours and it gets in the way, for example colleagues worry if their students are out doing work experience which means that they are down on their hours allocation

Cath enjoys her job but is not happy about the bureaucracy that comes from the College that does not recognise that academic is different to vocational. Her next move could be back in secondary school teaching as assistant head. The only roles she sees within the college are assistant principal or head of faculty and neither of those roles appeal.

New job titles were also considered a barrier.

'There are new job titles 'work shop manager', 'facilitator'. People don't know what these mean. Language has changed. You used to be an FE lecturer and were paid

more than school teachers, we were somewhere between schools and Uni's. Now it is fragmented'.

The job titles that were sometimes used to articulate roles were thought to be confusing and might put people off from applying for jobs. The term lecturer was felt to be no longer always used as the main definition to describe the role and that this had undermined the status within the profession. This was also linked with the expansion of the lecturers' role in often delivering IAG, literacy and numeracy. This was seen to have diluted the subject specialist that lecturers have.

'The conditions have all been undermined. It doesn't have the same respectability or status i.e. you are not just a subject specialist you have to do everything, literacy, numeracy etc'.

Term and conditions were identified generally as an issue. Those who have been in the sector a long time have described having terms and conditions which were better than the school sector. It has been suggested that these have been systematically eroded over the years. As such any kudos in working in the FE sector has been eradicated.

The prevalence of sessional and part-time work was considered a barrier by some. The need for some lecturers to take sessional work at a number of institutions was seen as a challenge for some people. The challenge is that many indicated that they only did teacher training when they had a full time contract.

Career development opportunities are seen as limited within the sector. Respondents suggested that there were few opportunities for promotion and that most tended to be 'dead men's shoes'. The opportunities that were available were in management but there was little training or succession planning implemented. These combined with low staff turnover in some colleges created a very static workforce.

'This has changed a lot over the years. We used to have better T and C, our salaries were much better. Pay at the college is reasonable but there is no career progression. We have 200 staff and 5 senior leadership, not a lot of chance for promotion there'.

As the case studies and the literature demonstrate the many people 'fall in' to FE and are often recruited rather than applying for available or advertised opportunities. People were recruited to a sessional role by someone they knew. Many of these went on to make successful careers in the FE sector.

To further explore the recruitment issues within colleges, we conducted a brief review of 20 recently advertised job applications, advertised in FE Jobs and the Guardian FE websites² from a range of vocational and academic subjects³ across England.

² <http://jobs.theguardian.com/> and <http://www.fejobs.com/>

³ Seven jobs were in vocational subjects, four in STEM subjects and the rest were social science/humanities disciplines.

Review of 20 Recent Job Adverts

The findings were:

- There was consistency in the way that the jobs were described with 18 describing the available post as lecturer, one describing the job as tutor and one tutor/lecturer
- 11 jobs were full-time of which two were temporary, for the nine part-time jobs three were temporary and hourly paid
- There was an inconsistent requirement for qualifications:
 - 12 required a degree and either holding a relevant teaching qualification/certificate or working towards one;
 - one requiring a degree but no teaching qualification;
 - three required a subject specialism at level 2/3 and a teaching qualification;
 - three said qualified in a subject and relevant industry experience, but no teaching qualification; and
 - one asked for two professional references and evidence of working in a college.

2.4.4 Parity of esteem and deregulation

Parity of esteem between all teachers is an issue which arose within Alison Wolf's Review of Vocational Education (2011). Qualifications are transferrable between schools and FE colleges, although as many of them will be contextualised it will be necessary to undertake some CPD to transfer over from, say, school to FE or vice versa.

With the recent implementation of deregulation, the FE sector is no longer obliged to recruit qualified teachers – institutions can now set their own minimum standards and qualifications and, accordingly, determine the nature of the teaching posts in their organisations, the level of skills they require and what qualifications they expect. As a result some colleges may request qualifications that just provide an introduction to teaching in an education and skills environment for some teaching posts. It is unclear, as yet, what the full impact of deregulation might be. In these early post-Lingfield days there do not appear to be a lot of colleges stepping up publicly saying they do not want minimum teaching qualifications for their teaching workforce. All those spoken to as part of the research felt strongly that minimum qualifications for FE teaching (at least a Level 5) were essential.

Generally, when FE teaching posts are advertised previous teaching experience is requested. Traditionally, 90% of teaching qualifications in FE have been undertaken in-service not pre-service. If there are no minimum expectations with regard to qualifications, but colleges are asking for teaching experience, this will have a knock on effect on who and how this teaching experience is gained and how qualifications are funded. It is too early to identify any trends at this stage.

Bath College

Bath College have a strong commitment and were very clear that deregulation would not change their position on this. Their commitment is that all new people who do not have a teaching qualification must get one in two years. They are committed to having staff with at least minimum teaching qualifications. The College sees it as a wider quality issue and have a well-established internal CPD programme for all staff which includes:

- standard college induction
- differentiated Professional Improvement Programme (PIP), which involves staff who:
 - are new to teaching
 - are new to a teaching qualification
 - have been teaching for a while but whose (assessment) grades need improving
- an internal observation team of senior managers (including 4 teaching and learning coaches) with the requirement that all staff having an annual teaching observation.

While the same programme applies to all staff, they recognise a difference between vocational and 'craft' vocational subjects - where teachers have mainly come to FE after working in industry. These people tend to be older and even though they know their 'craft' they are still expected to do a teaching qualification within two years of arriving at the college. There is a recognition that it can be tough when people are trying to adjust to a new teaching load as well as undertake a qualification within the first two years of teaching.

2.4.5 Dual professionalism

Identification of "dual professionalism" is the key element of FE teacher status and professionalism - e.g. an individual might start off in construction, then move into teaching but not lose their professional identity as a construction skills specialist.

People might start as, say, an artist who comes to teach and then as time moves on might see themselves in a dual role of artist and teacher.

Dual professionalism an important element of FE workforce – multi-professional models take this a step further.

FE is often seen as only being about vocational learning which has a lower 'perceived' status than academic learning. For example, if a college is advertising for an A level

lecturer this would be seen as a teaching post. If they are advertising for a vocational subject it will not necessarily be viewed as a teaching post. Consequently, FE college lecturers are not always seen as real teachers and are not accorded the same status as teachers in schools. It was also reported that they are more poorly paid than schools and HE. Staff recruited from outside the sector (with business or industrial experience or specific skills) will nearly always experience a step down financially when they enter FE teaching.

There is a problem with graduates and potential recruits to the wider teaching sector not necessarily realising or understanding the potential in FE. Often this is because the school route is the one they are familiar with, the one most of them have come up through. Also, national messaging and things like school bursaries are much more prevalent for teaching. Teaching in schools is promoted much more widely, there are better opportunities and as a result graduates much more likely to have heard about, and be considering a career in, school teaching. There is no effective national messaging for FE.

Having said that, during the period that LLUK was responsible for the sector (and at a time when there was a requirement for a minimum teaching qualification for FE staff) the number of FE staff who were trained each year was higher than that for school teaching.

2.4.6 Choosing teaching or FE tutoring?

When exploring the choice of statutory education as opposed to FE there were a number of views. Many felt that these could not be compared in the same way as there is little marketing and promotion around opportunity to teach in FE compared to the secondary sector. As such, both primary and secondary education have a higher profile and public awareness.

ITE teachers suspect that FE provides staff with an opportunity to teach their subject and offered a backup or second choice if they were unsuccessful in obtaining a place on statutory teacher training. The vocational nature of the FE sector was also seen as contributing to this. If FE is perceived as being vocational orientated it is not therefore unsurprising that prospective teachers focus on the statutory sector.

'It is the academic/vocational thing. If you have vocational competence then FE is an option if you have been to uni and have academic qualifications then there are more options available than just FE. In our college 85-90% of our work is vocational. All the big colleges are vocationally focused'.

Often the student group is of key importance, in that people choose FE as they feel they will not have to experience the behavioural issues that are common in secondary and primary schools. This is often a misguided perception and one that may only become apparent after teacher training has commenced.

2.4.7 Securing a teaching qualification

There are a number of different ways of approaching getting a teaching qualification – e.g. SCITT (School Centred Initial Teacher Training) route, studying at FE Colleges who are HEIs and award their own qualifications (e.g. Newcastle College Group awards its own

Level 5 qualifications), in-service programmes, HE programmes (e.g. PGCEs). The main substantive qualification for teachers in FE is Level 5 though more are completing at Level 6 or 7. It is a matter of debate whether FE teaching necessarily needs graduates. There are some teaching situations where aptitude and empathy might be more important qualities in a teacher than high qualification levels. Also, some subjects are easier than others in terms of expectations and qualifications. Hairdressing, for example, only actually requires a Level 3 plus industry experience and evidence of regular updating.

Not one size fits all, however. An alternative route into FE teaching could be to do the Award in Education and training (old PTLLS) and work up through the Certificate to the Diploma. The NCG used to have lots of in-service students but now have over 60% pre-service, which is a change. They have found an increased interest in introductory programmes, i.e. pre-service Level 3 introductory programmes where individuals can achieve teaching qualifications in bite-size chunks, allowing them to balance the new job and learning.

Qualifications can be transferrable (where QTLS is achieved) but contextualised in the first instance – e.g. if you want to teach in school you would have a school placement and a school based mentor and do modules that relate specifically to school. If you wanted to cross over you would need to do CPD to re-contextualise.

Finding out about the option of teaching in FE not always easy. If people have an interest in teaching they will probably Google it, but generally FE teaching will not come up as an option – the usual school teaching bodies will come up. One respondent suggested at a recent meeting with BIS that FE should appear as an option on those sites with appropriate links. The respondent said that instead a toolkit was developed, which sits on the ETF website and probably isn't known about apart from those people 'who know it is there'.

2.5 Future research questions

The discussion about the nature of the FE workforce has identified a number of issues in relation to its characteristics and the perceived barriers and enablers to entry. The impact of the Lingfield (2012b) report is as yet uncertain but will frame future discussions. At the moment there is no clear impact although a recent report from DBIS (2012) stated that the measures taken had made a positive difference.

The Institute for Learning (IfL) had strong views about this:

Loose talk about purpose of changes but reality is that 'unqualified teachers' now potentially able to work in sector. How many policy makers would be happy to send their children to be taught by untrained unqualified teachers?

They felt that the Foundation needs to:

- talk to ITE educators
- promote an expectation that teachers should be qualified to Level 5 (minimum) plus have access to ongoing CPD for subject updating and teaching and learning including meaningful use of new methods

- be clear on its position with regard to the role of pedagogy in teacher and learning and the quality of teaching and learning
- have a clear position on initial teacher education
- be clear on its position with regard to 'dual-professionalism'.

The IfL felt strongly that there was a need to weigh up which is more important - business freedom or high quality and trained teaching staff.

3 Initial Teacher Education

3.1 Introduction

The previous section has outlined how broad and diverse the education and skills sector is, and how people find their way into teaching through a range of formal and informal routes. There is a concern that traditional modes of supporting people to develop pedagogic skills necessary for effective teaching and learning are not as robust or relevant as they should be. One of these concerns is the extent to which teacher educators themselves have the right ranges of skills and backgrounds, aligned to concerns about the nature of that training, and how it is both organised and assessed. There is a perception that many teacher educators, particularly those delivering programmes in Higher Education Institutions gravitate from humanities and liberal study backgrounds. Research conducted by Noel (2006) identified the workforce was predominantly female, white, older and better qualified than the general FE teaching workforce. They predominantly come from backgrounds teaching in Business and Management, Social Sciences and Humanities. It will be important for ETF to understand the characteristics of provision of ITE, to assess the extent to which it is fit for purpose, and to assess the extent to which it provides a quality learning experience for FE educators.

3.2 ITE and professionalisation of the sector

Both the current and previous governments have been concerned with the quality and status of the education and skills sector. Although both Governments have different approaches, they both shared the common characteristic of wishing to improve the quality of teaching in the sector and to improve the professional status of teachers who work in the sector; what has become known as the professionalisation agenda. As Lucas (2013) indicates, the previous Labour Government overarching policy for improvement in the sector was to create a national system for qualifications, with built in standards and regulations, similar to the system operating in schools. It was believed that there would be an additional benefit of improved teaching which would create similar levels of esteem and sense of professionalism as those working in schools. Reforms included:

- LLUK standards for teachers in the learning and skills sector;
- Compulsory 30 hours CPD requirement for FE teachers;
- Mandatory units of assessment for ITE;
- All new teachers and trainers in the sector to hold a teaching qualification and working towards Qualified Teacher Learning and Skills status (QTLS) or Associate Teacher Learning and Skill status (ATLS)
- Regulations introduced by DIUS introducing QTLS and a compulsory CPD requirement;
- ITE providers go through Standards Verification UK endorsement and commence teaching and assessing;
- ITT qualifications based upon the new LLUK standards and assessment units;
- Compulsory membership of the Institute for Learning (IfL) (Lucas, 2013).

The Coalition Government has adopted a different approach to professionalism and improvement. In 2010, 'Skills for Sustainable Growth', and its parallel publication, 'Investing

in Skills for Sustainable Growth', set out the Government's strategy for skills with the main emphasis on providing funding targeted at young people and increasing apprenticeships. In December 2011, the Department for Business Innovation and Skills (DBIS) published the 'New Challenges, New Chances: Further Education and Skills System Reform Plan' which set out the Government's reform plans for the FE and skills system for adults aged 19 and over in England. New Challenges, New Chances created an Independent Review Panel to look at improving professionalism in the sector under Lord Lingfield. The interim and final report of the Independent Review^(2012a, 2012b) made a number of recommendations, which were all enacted and included:

- The requirement for appropriate qualifications for staff and CPD to be made discretionary instead of compulsory;
- The Learning and Skills Improvement Service (LSIS) to replace IfL as the organisation providing support on professionalising the workforce;
- The need for a review by LSIS to rename and simplify in-service teaching qualifications;
- The removal of teachers' statutory obligation to register with the Institute for Learning.
- New teaching staff should complete a new preparatory award within a normal probationary period;
- Employers should support this through the provision of appropriate opportunities and time away from teaching;
- Lecturers should extend and update their occupational subject and pedagogical expertise, including the new Cert FE or Dip FE where appropriate;
- Employers should support CPD in occupational and pedagogical realms;
- Lecturers should participate in observed teaching, appraisal, self-assessment and peer review;
- Employers should develop, in partnership with employees, performance management, promotion and succession planning.

The overarching conclusion from Lingfield was that setting standards from above had failed to deliver improvements in professionalism and that the sector needed to have greater autonomy to flourish. This led in September 2013 to the de-regulation of qualifications, with the removal of the requirement to obtain teaching qualifications within a certain timeframe which in effect made employers and the sector responsible for the level of qualifications held by teachers and allowing them to decide what continuing professional development was appropriate.

3.3 ITE: what the literature says

3.3.1 Characteristics of the workforce

There is a limited evidence base on the characteristics including qualifications held by teachers who train teachers for the education and skills workforce. If the size and characteristics of the education and skill sector is difficult the map, then doing the same for those delivering Initial Teacher Education is even more challenging. Again the data sources are insufficiently distinct so that neither SIR, LFS nor SOC codes define this group differently from teachers.

Crawley (2013) has done research in this area. He found there were no accurate figures of the number of teacher educators working in the post-compulsory education sector but has

estimated their number based on the number of ITE students in FE between 2007 and 2010 to estimate that the sector is made up of 1,500 teacher educators.

In 2006 Noel conducted a mapping of Post-Compulsory Education and Training (PCET) network, which consisted of 25 HEIs and FECs who delivered qualifications and CPD and generated returns from 128 teacher educators. Noel found that 66% of teacher educators were female, generally older than the rest of the sector (94% being 41 or older) and predominantly white (0.8% non-white).

In addition, Noel found that teacher educators were concentrated in certain subject areas – particularly Business & Management Studies and Social Science and Humanities. These teacher educators had a narrower subject specialism than their trainees and there was often duplication of subject specialisms within the same provider organisation. Harkin *et al.*(2008) made almost identical findings, noting that relatively few teacher educators came from craft backgrounds, or from maths and science backgrounds, with 25 of the 88 surveyed coming from Skills for Life background and 18 coming from Business, management, law and finance. However they also highlighted that teacher educators come from a variety of professional backgrounds, some educated to doctoral level, with others having vocational qualifications with few formal qualifications.

In a later research study Crawley (2013) surveyed approximately 29% (436 teacher educators) of the workforce to identify their views on their professional identity and demographic profile. In these results,

- 77% were female, which is higher than that reported by Harkin, *et al.*(2008) at 60% and Noel who estimated that 66% were female;
- they were overwhelmingly white (96%) and
- 84% aged between 45 and 65 years of age.

Simmons and Thompson (2007) explain this ‘feminisation’ being the result of decline in traditional male dominated craft-based technical and industrial backgrounds replaced by more service sector jobs, such as Health and Social Care, Business Administration and Visual and Performing Arts. They also argue that negative changes in the sector, associated with ‘turbulence’ within the sector arising from economic and political change outside, such as deteriorating pay, increased hours of work, reduced job security; less professional autonomy; and an increased managerialism within the sector has led more women to join the sector and men to leave the sector.

Crawley (2013) argued that the lack of diversity in the teacher educator workforce was the lack of formal and transparent recruitment and selection procedures when appointing new teacher educators. In many instances, roles were neither advertised (66.7% not advertised) nor subject to formal interview (65.4% not interviewed). This was partly explained by a number of vacancies being part-time and filled by staff already working at the college. In fact the interviews with teacher educators revealed that, informal word of mouth recommendation and being approached to consider a role being the norm, particularly for part-time roles. However, this was only the case for the first teacher educator roles, with promotions and management roles almost invariably involving interviews. Harkin *et al.* (2008) made similar findings with only 27.8% of teacher educators stating they had been recruited through a formal interview.

3.3.2 Skills needed for effective teacher education

Both Harkin *et al.* (2008) and Crawley(2013) argued that the skills and competencies of teacher educators are of primary importance rather than any lack of diversity when it comes to the quality of ITE.

Harkin recommended the formation of a Teacher Educator Development group to explore and refine the skills knowledge and attributes that teacher educators need to be effective. Harkin also recommended exploring the possibility of developing optional professional development for teacher educators at QCF level 6 or 7 which awarding bodies could use as a basis for educators professional development. Crawley developed this idea further by conducting a survey of teacher educators to identify what he believed were there most important essential characteristics needed to be a good PCE teacher educator. Crawley made 756 contacts which included 140 organisations, 180 current teacher trainees, 250 new or experienced teacher educators, 25 prospective teacher educators and 161 survey responses with teacher educators. The essential characteristics to be a good teacher educator identified in phase one of this research included:

- The ability to model good practice in teaching, and knowingly use praxis;
- Flexibility, adaptability, availability;
- Gaining the professional respect of other teachers;
- Capacity to challenge self and others' actions and values/philosophies;
- Skills in developing professional beliefs, values and practice in others;
- Capacity to empower other teachers;
- Acknowledging/respecting/using others' skill sets/contexts;
- Encouraging independent/critical thinking in others;
- The ability to relate the taught elements of initial teacher education to a wide diversity of workplace settings;
- Broad range of teaching experience;
- Innovative and charismatic;
- Passionate about teaching and learning;
- Capacity to work with a wide range of teachers to challenge and inspire their development;
- Ability to step outside own comfort zone and enjoy that challenge; and
- The 'even more' quality (demonstrating a wide range of professional confidence as a good teacher, but 'even more' so).

In phase two Crawley asked the teacher educators to identify which characteristics they believed they already held out of the 16 listed above. The highest rated response was 'passionate about teaching and learning' (95%). Interestingly the lowest rated item still had 60% of respondents believing that they already had it which was the 'even more' quality.

3.3.3 Implications for the quality of ITE experience

Researchers and commentators have suggested a number of ways in which teacher educators can be supported to fulfil their role. Firstly, better support and professional development opportunities through mentoring support. Harkin (2012) explored the views of recently qualified teachers on their vocational mentors and found that their mentoring experience in the workplace was patchy and inconsistent. Secondly sufficient time to fulfil their dual role as teacher educator and teacher is a necessary precondition to quality.

Thirdly, on the issue of subject specialism it has been suggested that the recruitment within teacher educator teams of people with subject specific experience to fully support staff in their specialist subjects is necessary. Bailey and Schoch (2010) highlighted the importance of subject specific mentoring in supporting the development of trainee teachers, emphasising that they have a role in developing appropriate levels of standards in their subject specialism. They went on to say that without specific knowledge the teacher educators will be unable to support the trainees fully being unable to give clear and expert guidance on the way in which to approach the particular challenges of teaching their own specific subject. Lucas *et al.* (2012) in a survey of FE teacher-educators and 20 HEI partnerships, found that teacher-educators experienced difficulty in providing adequate support for trainees to develop specialist teaching skills. This was as a result of the diversity of subjects and occupations that FE programmes cater for and led trainee teachers to be reliant on workplace mentoring support which was at best uneven. In addition, only 2 of the 20 HEIs offered some sort of module choice that allowed trainees to develop skills related to their subject in construction or engineering. The only exception was Skills for Life Initial Teacher Training courses, which require subject specialist options.

3.4 Perspectives from stakeholders and providers

3.4.1 Characteristics of the ITE workforce

Both the professional and the operational stakeholders that participated in this scoping study suggested that the ITE workforce can be summarised as follows:

- Committed, connected professionals helping trainees improve confidence, acquire teaching skills and make connections.
- Committed experts in initial teaching learning are under siege. Will colleges continue to support the work?
- All the teaching and learning coaches need to be capable of dealing with Level 5 trainees.
- There is no specific qualification for teacher educators. There is a lot of pressure to keep up-to-date because of their teacher educator role but they rarely get sufficient time and space for their own professional development.
- It is quite difficult to get into ITE – people tend to drift into it, self-select, just pick up opportunities as they present themselves or they may pick up the odd session and find that they like it.
- Once people enter ITE they tend to stay.

- FE staff tend to be (on average) 10 years older than school teaching staff and teacher educators tend to be 10 years' older again (although younger people are starting to enter FE).
- They need to be well networked – there is a national research network 'Teacher Education in Lifelong Learning – TELL), UCET and a number of regional forums.

A teacher educator is, by definition, a generic role although may well make use of some previous discipline. It means that teacher educators actually get quite a lot of autonomy but also means that as they are a small specific group of staff that need to ensure they are well networked in order to be able to keep up-to-date and current key issues for teacher educators.

Within the University context the ITE workforce is seen as graduate, experienced and older. Here, the workforce is drawn from experienced teachers who have extensive experience within the FE sector and have often previously worked in partner colleges.

Within the FE sector the ITE workforce varies from college to college. In some colleges the best teachers are selected for the role while in others it is based on availability of hours.

'In my previous college ITE was part of quality there and we had a head of department who was very committed and interested in ITE. Here it is unclear where it fits. It is not seen as FE or HE and it doesn't sit within someone's remit. It is volatile in terms of staffing'.

3.4.2 Subject backgrounds of the ITE workforce

The perception that the ITE workforce was predominantly from a humanities background was both accepted by some respondents and rejected by others. Most said this was not something they had thought about or discussed with colleagues.

'This has not really occurred to me but thinking about my team, I have an English background and the others come from languages, business, communication. Having an English background is quite common as articulation and communication is so important'.

'Not something I have thought about. I don't think this is the case. I don't really know the background of the ITE team but I know at least one was an engineer and another taught functional skills'.

There was general agreement that many teacher educators came from a humanities background. However, most ITE teams argued that they had a broad range of disciplines within their team. One interviewee said their team included; psychologists, sociologists, law lecturers, engineers, a police trainer and a beauty therapist. This they felt supported them in meeting the needs of all their students. This provider had made a conscious effort to recruit people who did not come from humanities disciplines.

'We particularly wanted someone from a craft background. We had an application from a Deputy Principal who had recently been made redundant and had an engineering background. He was ideal'.

There was recognition that having someone from a vocational background could be really useful particularly with lecturers working with students taking lower level qualifications. One college recognised that they had recruited people who had a secondary school background, but had also recruited people who had specialised in skills for life and skills for work as well. All their teacher educators had a degree.

'There are always some who are naturally good at this kind of work. Others would see it, however, as too complex and possibly too much work.'

One example is Newcastle College Group (NCG) where there is a large ITE team - 70% coming from humanities and 30% maths, science and vocational backgrounds. Half of the team have either EFL, ESOL or literacy/numeracy backgrounds. Research undertaken by the NCG indicated that the people who most noticeably 'consciously' decided that they would like to enter teacher education were people with these backgrounds – they saw themselves entering a specialist teacher education role. The NCG research also indicated those people with ESOL type backgrounds saw themselves as a teacher educator first and a subject specialist second. Those with, for example, an engineering background saw themselves as engineers first and teacher educator second. The NCG is continuing to develop different qualifications for ITE, sometimes steered by bursaries or demand– they are, for example, still commissioned to run some of the PTTLs which are either self-funded or employer funded.

3.4.3 What attracts people into ITE and what are the barriers?

Career paths to becoming a teacher educator were varied within the group we spoke to. Some people are allocated to the role while others applied for the position. Within the HE context teacher educators were often recruited from partner colleges as they had good relationships with the University team and understood local systems and procedures. ITEs said it was not unusual for colleagues to drift into an ITE role because they had provided mentoring for teacher trainees or had done a guest lecture.

'FE people have delivered the course and know the course and the HE systems. People will get into FE ITE often through being a mentor for a PGCE programme. Most people fall into it because they have mentored or there is time on their timetable that needs filling.'

'I applied for the ITE post, but there were no particular requirements for ITE, I had no experience at all, I was really surprised to get it.'

There appeared to be general consensus that for many teacher educators in FE it was less about them choosing or seeking ITE as a career as being allocated the role because they had time available.

'Teacher educators should be the best teachers taught by the best teachers. Often it is people who couldn't teach then teach the teachers'

'If you have a pulse you can do ITE.'

'People come into ITE through having their arms twisted. No one asks to teach it. I look around and see who might be good. I then bully them in to doing the job'.

Alan Case study

Alan left school and went to work in a stationary shop in the late 60's. This was followed by a number of jobs including working in a cash and carry warehouse, printers and a furniture shop for three years. He decided to return to education and took O' levels and then A' levels at a local FE college. These were followed by a degree in social sciences at University. After completing his degree Alan had no firm career plans, other than a fleeting consideration of social work or a career in the media. While attending a drama group at his old college he met someone he had previously studied with who offered him 3 hours a week teaching liberal studies. He taught students including hairdressers, electricians, carpenters and joiners etc. He built his hours up and was on a yearly contract for three years.

He then applied for a full time post at another local college teaching A' Level General Studies , Communication Studies, Media Studies and English Language. After working in FE for a number of years he completed an in-service Cert.Ed (1984-1986) followed by a Master's degree in Education Studies.

Alan first got into teacher education through teaching on the City and Guilds 7307 and then led the teacher training programmes for the college. He was made redundant in 2002 but continued to work at the college for 8 hours a week. At this point he was recruited by the Head of ITE at a local university for 4 hours a week which developed into a 0.8 post teaching on all the ITE programmes including Cert Ed and PGCEFE.

Alan has decided to semi retire this year, but continues to contribute to undergraduate Education Studies courses, PGCEHE programmes and writing books on FE teaching and learning.

The need to have a degree is a necessary requirement for teacher educators in higher education. It would seem that this is increasingly the case within FE as well. However, there were many examples provided of excellent teachers from a vocational background. Some respondents felt that the biggest barrier to becoming a teacher educator was the need for a degree. It was felt to place an artificial barrier on who could and could not be a teacher educator. It was recognised that this applied specifically to ITE within universities.

'If you are working on ITE in colleges there is no requirement to have a degree. But you need one for a university. This is a barrier. There are some brilliant teachers who might not have a degree, there should be other routes based on experience not just about qualifications. It would be good if there was some CPD route or a module that could be taken'.

3.4.4 Pedagogy and ITE

From the stakeholder perspectives there was absolute consensus from all those spoken to about the importance of pedagogy in ITE. They made the point that understanding how people learn, contextualised for differing settings (e.g. community, workplace learning) is critical for all teacher education. The stakeholders frequently referred to the PISA research by OECD and the link between high performing OECD countries and the prominence they give to pedagogy. The examples set by USA and Netherlands which have pedagogy structured into their programmes was given. Several expressed anger and dismay about recent policy developments which appear to undermine the importance of pedagogy as an integral part of professional teaching practice.

John

John is the programme area leader for painting and decorating level 2 and 3 learners. He has a teaching commitment of 700 hours and works full time at the college. He started full time in 2008 when he became programme leader; he is also an internal verifier. His students are full time 16+ and part time 19+ but he has worked from school age through foundation 1 to level 3 qualifications.

He started in painting and decorating when he left school at 16 and went to college (the same college he works at now) to do an apprenticeship. After completing this he set up his own business working for himself until 1999. He then decided to join the army and become a paratrooper (this had always been a career ambition).

After an injury he left the army and was in the process of applying for an English course at his local college. He bumped into one of his painting and decorating tutors who suggested he should have a go at teaching. He was offered sessional hours but didn't really think about it as a 'career' but thought he would have a go.

He started a teacher training qualification when he was employed full time in 2003 when he did the City and Guilds 7304 level 1 and his A1 qualification. In 2008 he did the Teaching in the Lifelong Learning Sector Level 5 Diploma (DTTLS) and V1 qualification. Dave liked the idea of doing the teaching qualification incrementally as it helped to build the experience. He felt the C & G qualification helped with classroom practice, developing interactive teaching and classroom behaviour. The observations were the most useful for helping to develop practice. The Diploma was more academic. It helped him to think academically and move away from a 'trade mentality'. It helped to develop a wider knowledge not just the trade but being able to work with parents and think in broader terms about his role.

He is currently doing a degree in business part time (which is self-funded). He hopes to become a curriculum manager, as there will be a role in a few years when a colleague retires and a degree will give him a good chance.

The teacher educators noted that their trainees were not always initially enthusiastic about learning about pedagogical theory, not all trainee teachers recognised its purpose and they did not really know a lot about theory until they started. However, once they had been through the learning its purpose became more relevant. It was also emphasised by some that theory should not be at the expense of class room experience and learning to teach.

The demands of teacher training are felt to be more challenging for some teachers than others. So for example people reported that there was reticence from some FE teachers who might have had a bad time at school or who were confident in their professional knowledge but struggled with new, more academic, challenges. These people might continue to struggle, or they might find that they have academic skills hitherto unrecognised.

Some FE teachers / tutors may only have done a teaching qualification when they got a full time job. This may be many years after they started their teaching career. For others the teacher training programme was the start of other academic courses.

The challenge for teacher educators is that people don't see themselves as teachers, and as such they may not see the need or benefit of training in teaching. The problem of educators who persist in identifying themselves solely or mainly with their occupational areas were prevalent throughout the discussion. As such this can undermine ITE and the importance of this as a professional activity.

'But people don't see themselves as teachers; it is the dual professionalism thing. They are a hairdresser who teaches rather than a teacher of hairdressing'.

3.4.5 ITE response to recent policy changes and professionalisation

One stakeholder suggested that when changes to ITE were first mooted everyone thought it would be a disaster, but actually it hasn't happened because the sector is used to change and has absorbed it. ITE is good at responding flexibly, and generally has responded well, although it is down to senior managers in provider institutions to decide what priority they are going to give to ITE. Another stakeholder suggested that there needs to be an equal focus on continuous professional development alongside ITE as teaching skills change and need to be updated; for example the impact of different classroom practice, new modes of assessment, use of technology to monitor attendance, VLEs, communication with students etc. all need professional development. Some of the issues identified were:

- The shift away from in-service teacher education to pre-service full time or part-time teacher education may not equip teachers;
- One suggestion was that there was a need for professional teacher educator standards (preferably, but not essentially, at Masters level). There is a clear career trajectory for teacher educators in EFL/ESOL backgrounds through Cambridge University Teaching awards - it is worth replicating something like this for teacher educators more generally;
- The NCG validate their own Level 5 and validate programmes for different settings. More colleges with Foundation Degrees could start to do this, and as more colleges

are able to offer full degree awarding powers at Level 6 and Level 7 they will be able to increase range of courses offered;

- More collaborative working is needed to develop models of best practice and partnership approaches;
- Need to provide additional support to teacher educators – trainees get no remission now for the work.

The Association of School and College Leaders (ASCL) suggested that any discussion about whether or not the right people were teacher educators missed the point. They suggested that part of the problem has been the overly bureaucratic process of paper based submissions of evidence. *“We want people to have demonstrable and recognised skills – but developed through an intelligent system”* based on model of Qualified Teacher Status. Employ people to teach, support, coach, mentor, shadow them for as long as it takes and assure their competence to teach by undertaking observations. These could be undertaken by college colleagues using guidance generated by ETF. Quality assurance and consistency between colleges would be achieved using the HE model - on a peer basis. In their view, ETF should provide the framework and colleges would embed it. This would use a coaching model which it can be argued, is far more effective than a classroom based teaching model.

Allied to this was a discussion about the need to clarify what ITE qualifications exist. For example there is great confusion over Qualified Teacher Learning and Skills (QTLS). Students don't know about it. There is a need to clarify and promote this more effectively both within and outside of the sector. A focus on this would contribute to a stronger sense of professionalism and support parity with the statutory sector.

4 Summary

4.1 Introduction

The research presented in this report was undertaken over a rapid time-frame and whilst a range of individuals were able to participate in the study there will be voices and perspectives that do not feature in the report. That said, the evidence presented in this report frames two key issues and sets out the scope of key dimensions within each. Common themes which cut across both of the question areas were levels of esteem and associated salaries and terms of condition which the FE sector enjoys now compared both with the past and with current alternative opportunities. The second factor which flavoured almost every other conversation was about the changes imposed on the sector and the rapid pace of change, review and change again which had particular implications for the professionalism agenda.

4.2 Characterising the FE workforce

The sector is diverse, broad and subject to change. People enter the sector as teacher or as teacher educators for a wide range of reasons, but the evidence suggests that their move into a career in the education and skills sector is more often due to happenstance than career planning. This could be celebrated. It brings a wide variety of people from different backgrounds and with different experiences to share their learning with students. This should contribute to an enriching, vibrant and diverse learning environment for staff and students alike.

The issue of investment in people through their training, working conditions and salary was repeatedly raised. Providers in the education and skills sector have to compete for talented teachers with other employers which include private sector employers, self-employed status and working in the statutory school sector. These alternative sources of employment may not only have better terms and conditions, but they may have better or taller career progression routes, and greater esteem and respect within the community.

Dual professionalism is an issue which featured strongly and needs strong leadership. It is clear that there is a perception that significant cohorts of FE teachers see themselves as subject specialists first and teachers second or not at all – but this is a false dichotomy – teachers can't see themselves as one or the other but have to be both. Teachers of both academic and vocational have to have subject expertise and they have to be credible in the eyes of their learners. But they also have to be good and effective teachers. There is a need for cultural change to support the notion of dual-professionalism and recognise and reward it. One suggested action was that it would be useful to provide a stage for teachers to share their practice and be recognised – some form of recognition system would be hugely important to many FE teachers – provide an individual boost and celebrate their expert teacher status.

At the moment Colleges are experiencing some skills shortages in specific areas where there are difficulties recruiting. At the moment there are few skills shortages for two structural reasons, firstly we are in demographic downturn (i.e. fewer learners) and economic downturn (i.e. fewer jobs outside the colleges therefore easier to recruit). But this will change. Demographic changes mean that the number of learners will increase within 5

years, economic upturn will have an impact and an ageing workforce will have a disproportionate effect on some sectors such as technical workforce and care provision. These shifts need to be anticipated and planned for so that Colleges and other learning providers can draw from a talent pool of skilled professionals and support them through their professional development. The challenge for recruiting people into the sector has to be managed alongside that to train and retain talented teachers.

4.3 Characterising the ITE workforce

The features of the FE workforce reflect those of the initial teacher education workforce. The characteristics of teacher educators across the sector are reported to be dominated by females, older workers and people with a more academic and humanities backgrounds. Their routes into ITE reflect those associated with routes into FE teaching in that they tend to drift or be directed into the role rather than have it as a deliberate career choice. Irrespective of this, discussions were focussed not so much on the background of people but on the space they have to deliver a curriculum which includes pedagogy theory and the extent to which ITE need to have subject specialisms to prepare teachers for effective classroom practice.

These discussions were held within the context of the Lingfield review. The challenges raised by Lingfield generated a number of responses. Many colleges and learning providers were re-stating their commitment to teacher education, but others were not. The status of an ITE department within a college appears to be dependent on where it fits in the college. When it has strong leadership ITE has a higher profile, but in some colleges ITE is a responsibility that is 'bolted on' to a managers other responsibilities. Similarly, some colleges are committed to securing ITE for their staff from external providers but this will not always be the case. It will be important to find out on a systematic basis how colleges are responding to the challenge in practice through a combination of College surveys to see what they say, and new entrant surveys alongside a larger scale analysis of job adverts to see what their recruitment practice is.

It was stressed throughout the consultations that any review of teacher education should focus not only on who the teacher educators are, but on the mode of delivery and the qualifications that are available. In terms of the mode of delivery, the role of mentor support was raised as it is currently not well developed but a coaching model could provide added value for all teachers but especially for new teachers. Others highlighted the need for clarity in qualifications that are available and about new National Standards for the sector.

Discussions ranged across a variety of options but issues included the need to promote the professional development of initial teacher educators by promoting opportunities to engage in research at masters and doctoral level that will have the dual impact of upskilling the workforce whilst providing research-informed evidence about the sector.

5 Annex 1: Methodology

5.1 Literature Review

The methodology for this rapid knowledge review was based on our own knowledge of the field, database searches of British Educational Index and Expanded Academic, supplemented by Google and Google scholar. The following keywords were used:

Keywords: Initial Teacher education (ITE), Teachers, Further education (FE), initial teacher training, teacher educators, recruitment, selection, career changers, education and training, quality, training, workplace learning, work based learning, barriers, enablers, mapping, equality and diversity, professionalism and vocational education, attracting, graduates, higher qualifications, [dual] professionalism, professional identity work based learning (WBL), Adult and Community Learning (ACL) and post-compulsory education. The review was particularly interested in research from the UK but used international evidence that illuminated the main areas of discussion.

The main research objectives related to this review are:

- Identify and examine the barriers and enablers in attracting candidates with higher qualifications/skills into the learning and skills sector.
- Explore whether ITE teaching is predominantly attracting people from a humanities background and, if so, assess the implications for a quality ITE experience?

To fully answer the main research questions we also explored literature describing or mapping who works in the sector and the qualifications they hold and the makeup of teacher educators within the sector.

5.2 Discussion themes

Q1	Q2
How would you characterise the FE workforce? Is there a distinction between those teaching vocational subjects and those teaching academic subjects?	How would you characterise the ITE workforce?
What are the career trajectories of people who arrive in FE, what prompts them to join and what prompts them to leave?	What are the career trajectories of people who teach ITE, what prompts them to join and what prompts them to leave? Do ITE educators predominantly come from humanities – if so why?
What is attractive about a career in FE and what detracts people from the sector?	There is a perception that people come into FE from a practice base underpinned by vocational qualifications. Is this your perception? How does this act as a barrier to encouraging a wider recruitment for ITE

	educators?
What are the perceived barriers and drivers to joining the FE sector as a teacher?	In ITE how do those who have come from work based learning differentiate their roles from training teaching?
Why do people with academic qualifications have a tendency to choose teaching in primary/secondary education rather than FE?	How important and relevant is pedagogy to FE teaching staff who are characterised as seeing themselves as practitioners first and foremost with teaching as a secondary activity
Is there a skills shortage in FE teachers (i.e. recruitment difficulties)? Or are there skills gaps (FE teaching staff need new skills as the sector changes)?	How can ITE respond to recent policy changes that impact upon demand for ITE?
How can the sector professionalise itself?	What can be done to further improve the quality of ITE to support professional practice in FE?

5.3 Case Study Interviews.

The Education Training Foundation has commissioned researchers at the University of Derby to explore the strategic issues associated with professionalising the FE sector and in particular looking at who works in the FE sector, who works in Initial Teacher Education and what issues face them both to continue to support and develop their learners.

We are going to ask you some questions about your own experiences of working in either FE or ITE. We are particularly interested in your progression route into your current role and your plans and ambitions for future development either within your current role or your next move.

We will be digitally recording these discussions so that we can take accurate notes I will then write up your case study and pass it back to you for information and comment. You can edit your notes or withdraw altogether at that point. However after I have sent you the notes and given you a week to respond you will not be able to withdraw from the study as we will have written up and submitted our report.

You will not be named in the report. Your notes and this recording will be kept on a secure password protected area on our University computer network.

Do you have any questions about this?

Do you agree to take part on this basis?

Question areas:

What is your current role?

Where do you work, how long have you been there, what subject do you teach level, type of student and number of teaching hours.

What jobs or other roles did you have before starting this current job?

Brief review of career history – particularly exploring any roles that involved teaching.

Did you want to work in FE?

Was this a logical progression, part of overall career ambition, was it something you dropped into?

Training history

What is your experience of ITE?

Career ambition

What would you like to do next? What do you need to do to get there?

ETF want to professionalise the FE sector. What does professionalisation mean to you?

How could your employer support your professional practice?

Annex 2: Research Participants

Sally Allen, Senior Lecturer and Course Leader for PGCE ITT programme, University of Portsmouth.

Kelly Briddon, Assistant Head of Teacher Education (FE & Skills), University of Derby.

Mark Carter, ITT Co-ordinator, Bath College.

Louise Clarke, Curriculum Manager: Initial Teacher Education and Professional Studies. Vision West Nottinghamshire College.

Jim Crawley, Senior Lecturer, Education Studies, Bath Spa University and Chair of UCET post-16 Committee.

Toni Fazaeli, Chief Executive, Institute for Learning.

Frances Farndon, Teaching and Learning Improvement Manager, Stephenson College.

Julie Harris, Apprenticeship Manager, UDC, University of Derby.

Stephan Jungnitz, Colleges Specialist, Association of School and College Leaders (ASCL).

Karen Lewis, FE Business Partner Leek and Buxton College.

Lianne McCarthy, Deputy Principal, Bath College.

Judy Lye Foster, Director of Teacher and Learning, Bath College.

James Noble-Rogers, Chief Executive, UCET.

Diane Thurston, Head of School of Education, Newcastle College Group

The case studies were offered anonymity in exchange for their career stories, their roles included:

- Acting Assistant Subject Head, ITE provider
- College ITE manager
- Business Studies Teacher and Team Manager at an FE college.
- Learning and Teaching Lecturer
- Programme Area Leader for Painting and Decorating at an FE College.

Bibliography

Anthony, G. & Ord, K. (2008). Change-of-career secondary teachers: motivations, expectations and intentions, *Asia-Pacific Journal of Teacher Education*, 36(4): 359-376.

AoC (2013). *Survey of Recruitment and Retention in Further Education Colleges 2013*. Association of Colleges (AoC).

Avis, J. and Bathmaker, A. (2006). From trainee to FE lecturer: trials and tribulations *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 58(2): 171–189.

Bailey, W. and Schoch, J. (2010). Subject Specialist Mentors in the Lifelong Learning Sector: who needs them? A case study approach. *Teaching in Lifelong Learning: A journal to inform and improve practice*, 2(1): 5-14.

Barber, M. and Mourshed, M. (2007). *How the World's Best-performing School Systems Come out on top*. New York: McKinsey & Company

BERA (2013). *Research and Teacher Education: The BERA Inquiry*. London: BERA.

Boyd, P., Harris, K. & Murray, J. (2007) *Becoming a Teacher Educator: Guidelines for the induction of newly appointed lecturers in Initial Teacher Education*. Bristol: ESCalate

Clow, R. (2005). Just teachers: the work carried out by full-time further education teachers, *Research in Post-Compulsory Education*, 10(1): 63–77.

Commission on Adult Vocational Teaching (2013). *It's About Work... Excellent Adult Vocational Teaching and Learning*. London: LSIS.

Crawley, J. (2013). 'Endless patience and a strong belief in what makes a good teacher': teacher educators in post-compulsory education in England and their professional situation. *Research in Post-Compulsory Education* 18 (4): 336-347

Crawley, J. (2012). 'On the brink' or 'designing the future'? Where next for Lifelong Learning Initial Teacher Education? *Teaching in Lifelong Learning: A journal to inform and improve practice*, 4(1): 2-12.

DBIS (2013). *Further Education Initial Teacher Training Bursary*. London: DBIS.

DBIS (2012). *Evaluation of FE Teachers' Qualifications (England) Regulations 2007*. London: DBIS.

Department for Education (2011). *Training our Next Generation of Outstanding Teachers: Implementation Plan*. London: Department for Education.

Education and Training Foundation (ETF) (2012). *Delivery Plan - August 2013 to April 2014*. Education and Training Foundation.

Elliot, G. (2013). Understanding the educational workforce in post-compulsory education: introduction to the special issue. *Research in Post Compulsory education* 18(4): 327-335.

European Training Foundation (2013). *European Training Foundation Strategy for Vocational Education and Training In A Lifelong Learning Context 2013 – 2020 and Action Plan*.

Further Education Strategy Group (2012). *Employee Perceptions of Further Education Developing our Understanding of the Reputation of the Further Education Sector*. Further Education Strategy Group

Gleeson, D and Mardle, G. (1980). Further education or training? A case study in the theory and practice of day-release education. London: Routledge and Kegan Paul.

Gleeson, D., Davies, J., and Wheeler, E. (2005). On making and taking of professionalism in the further education workplace. *British Journal of Sociology of Education*, 26(4): 445-460.

Haggard, C., Slostad, F. & Winterton, S. (2006). Transition to the School as Workplace: Challenges of second career teachers, *Teaching & Teacher Education*, 17(4): 317–327

Hammond, M. (2002). 'Why teach? A case study investigating the decision to train to teach ICT', *Journal of Education for Teaching*, 28(2): 136-148.

Harkin, J. (2012). *IfL Preparatory Research to Inform the Work of the Commission on Adult Vocational Teaching and Learning*. Institute for Learning.

Harkin J. (2008). *Independent Summary Report to QIA of the CETT Professionalising the Workforce Case Studies*.

Harkin J, Cuff, A, and Rees. S (2008). *Research into the Developmental Needs of Teacher Educators for Effective Implementation of the New Qualifications for Teachers, Tutors and Trainers in the Lifelong Learning Sector in England*. London: LLUK.

Hayes, D. (2004). 'Recruitment and retention: insights into the motivation of primary trainee teachers in England', *Research in Education*, 7(1): 37- 49.

Institute for Learning (IfL) (2012). *Attracting, Training and Retaining the Best Teachers A Response to the Education Committee on behalf of the Institute for Learning*.

Institute for Learning (IfL) (2011). *What 5,000 Further Education Teachers and Trainers Think About Initial Teacher Training(ITT)*. A report on a survey of teachers' and trainers' views on initial teacher training in further education and skills, by the Institute for Learning. London: IfL. Available from: http://www.ifl.ac.uk/data/assets/pdf_file/0016/26170/IfL-ITT-report_final.pdf [Accessed 20 February 2014]

Jephcote, M. and Salisbury, J. (2009). Further education teachers' accounts of their professional identities. *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 25(7): 966–972.

Lawy, R., & Tedder, M. (2011). Mentoring and individual learning plans: issues of practice in a period of transition. *Research in Post-Compulsory Education*, 16(3): 385-396.

Lifelong Learning UK. (2011). *Further Education Workforce Data for England. An Analysis of the Staff Individualised Record Data 2009–10*. Coventry: LLUK.

Lifelong Learning UK. (2010). *Lifelong Learning UK– AACCS LMI (Version 1) March 2010*. Coventry: LLUK.

LLUK and Alliance Sector Skills (2010). *Sector Skills Assessment Report for the Further Education Sector in England*. Coventry: LLUK.

Lingfield, (2012a). *Professionalism in Further Education: Interim Report of the Independent Review Panel*. London: Department for Business, Innovation and Skills.

Lingfield, (2012b). *Professionalism in Further Education: Final Report of the Independent Review Panel*. London: Department for Business, Innovation and Skills.

LSIS (2013). *An Analysis of the Staff Individualised Record Data 2011-2012*. London: LSIS.

LSIS (2013). *Further Education and Skills in England New Qualifications for Teachers and Trainers Phase Two - Findings Report*. London: LSIS. LSIS (2013). *Teaching and Training Qualifications for the Further Education and Skills Sector in England (2013) Guidance for employers and practitioners*. London: LSIS.

LSIS and HOLEX (2013). *Adult and Community Learning Workforce Survey 2011/12*.

London: LSIS. LSIS (2012). *Further Education College Workforce Data for England An analysis of the Staff Individualised Record (SIR) 2010-11*. London: LSIS.

LSIS and Association of Employment Advisers (2013). *Work Based Learning Workforce Survey 2011/12*. London: LSIS.

LSIS (2011). *The Further Education and Skills Sector in 2020: A social productivity approach*. London: LSIS.

Lucas, N. (2013). One step forward, two steps back? The professionalization of further education teachers in England, *Research in Post-Compulsory Education*, 18(4): 389-401.

Lucas, N., Nasta, T. & Rogers, L. (2012). From fragmentation to chaos? The regulation of initial teacher training in further education, *British Educational Research Journal*, 38(4): 677-695.

Lucas, N. and Nasta, (2010). State regulation and the professionalization of further education teachers: a comparison with schools and HE? *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 62(4): 441-454.

Lucas, N. and Unwin, L. (2009). Developing teacher expertise at work: in-service trainee teachers in colleges of further education in England. *Journal of Further and Higher Education*, 33(4): 423-433.

Mayotte, G. (2003). Stepping stones to success: previously developed career competencies and their benefits to career switchers transitioning to teaching, *Teaching and Teacher Education*, 19(3): 681-695.

Moore, R. and Pitard, J. (2012). *A Longitudinal Evaluation of the Career Change Program at Victoria University 2005-2011*. Melbourne: School of Education, Victoria University.

Murray, J. (2010). Towards a new language of scholarship in teacher educators' professional learning? *Professional Development in Education*, 36(1-2): 197-209.

Nasta, T. (2009). *The Knowledge that you do Every day—Easing the transition of those who enter teaching from vocational backgrounds*, London: London Centre for Excellence in Teaching, Institute of Education, University of London.

Noel, P. (2007). *Communities of Practice and Routes into Teacher Education: Research Findings from the University of Huddersfield Consortium for PCET*.

Noel, S. (2006). *Communities of Practice. Final Report to the Consortium Steering Committee*.

Noel, P. (2006). The secret life of teacher educators: becoming a teacher educator in the education and skills sector. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*. 58(2): 151–170.

Margo, J., Benton, M., Withers, K. and Sodh, S. with Tough, S. (2008). *Those who can?* London: IPPR.

Murray, J. (2008) 'Teacher Educators' Induction Into Higher Education: Work-Based Learning In The Micro Communities of Teacher Education' *European Journal of Teacher Education*. 31(2): 117–33.

OECD (2012). *Teachers Matter: Attracting, Developing and Retaining Effective Teachers. Pointers for Policy Development*. Paris: OECD.

OECD (2011). *OECD Reviews of Vocational Education and Training Learning for Jobs. Pointers for Policy Development*. Paris: OECD.

OECD (2009). *Learning for Jobs. OECD Reviews of Vocational Education and Training*. Paris: OECD.

Orr, K. (2009). Dual roles and dual identities: enhancing the experience of in-service teacher training in English Further Education. *Teaching in Lifelong Learning: A Journal to Inform and Improve Practice*, 1 (2). pp. 5-13.

Orr, K. & Simmons, R. (2010). Dual identities: the in-service teacher trainee experience in the English further education sector, *Journal of Vocational Education & Training*, 62(1): 75-88.

Parsons, D & Berry-Lound, D. (2004). *Qualifications of Staff in LSC-Funded Provision*. DfES Research Report no. 590. Coventry: Education and skills Council (LSC).

Pitard, J. & Greenfield, R. (2011). Maximising the industry experience and skills of career change teachers. *VOCAL: The Australian Journal of Vocational Education And Training In School*, 96-99.

Robson, J. (1998). A profession in crisis: Status, culture and identity in the further education college. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training* 50(4): 585–607.

Simmons, R. and Thompson, R. (2007). Teacher educators in post-compulsory education: gender, discourse and power. *Journal of Vocational Education and Training*, 59(4): 517-533.

Skills Commission (2010). *Teacher Training in Vocational Education An Inquiry by the Skills Commission into Teacher Training in Vocational Education*. London: Skills Commission.

Strebler, M., Neathey, F. and Tackey, N.D. (2005). *Recruitment and Retention of Teachers with Industrial or Professional Experience*. London: LSDA.

Teeman, D., Lewis, K., Woodthorpe, A., Ridley, K. and Donahue, B. (2005). *Characteristics of Unsuccessful Applicants to PGCE Courses*. Slough: NFER

Thornton, M. and Reid, I. (2002). 'Primary teacher recruitment: careers guidance and advice', *Education*, 3-13, 29(2): 49-54.

Thurston, D. (2010) The invisible educators: exploring the development of Teacher Educators in the Further Education system. *Teaching in lifelong learning: A journal to inform and improve practice*, 2(1): 47-55.

Teaching and Learning Research Programme. (TLRP) (2008). *Challenge and Change in Further Education. A Commentary by the Teaching and Learning Research Programme.* London: TLRP.

UKCES (2010). *Lifelong Learning Sector Sector Qualifications Strategy.* Wath-Upon-Deerne: UKCES.

UKCES (2012). *Sector Skills Insights: Education.* Wath-Upon-Deerne: UKCES.

Wilkins, C. (2013). *Elite' Career Changers in Initial Teacher Education.* European Conference on Educational Research, Cadiz, Spain 18-20 September 2013

Wilson, P., Hopwood, V. and Antill, M. (2005). *Recruitment and Retention in the Post-16 Education and Skills Sector.* London: DfES.

Wolf, A. (2011). *Review of Vocational Education – The Wolf Report.* London: Department for Education and Department for Business, Innovation & Skills.

York Consulting (2004). *Evaluation of Further Education Initial Teacher Training Bursary Initiative.* London: DfES.